

DRAFT MINUTES

At a future meeting the council will consider the accuracy of these minutes so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of the next meeting to confirm whether or not they have been amended

Minutes of a meeting of the Parish Council Planning Committee held on Thursday 19th April 2018 at the Village Hall, Tywardreath

Present Cllr Phillips, Cllr Rowse, Cllr Shroff, Cllr C Wildish

In attendance The Parish Clerk, Sally Vincent
4 members of the public (2 part)

In the absence of the Chairman, Cllr Hughes, Cllr Shroff proposed Cllr Rowse seconded and it was RESOLVED that Cllr Phillips should take the Chair for this meeting

17/92 Apologies Cllr Hughes

17/93 Declaration of Interests

Pecuniary	None
Non-Registerable	None
Dispensations	None

17/94 Public Questions

Alison White raised objections to PA18/02089, stating four main reasons. 1. The description of the location of the site was misleading. Porcupine Lane had never been in a development envelope, 2. Sustainability – there was poor access, no pavements, a car was needed to access shops and services. 3. The application was not appropriate for infill development as defined in the Cornwall Local Plan. 4. Development at this location could create an unwelcome precedent

John Elkington raised objections to PA18/02158. He noted that the development had already been done and had already been subject to enforcement action. Previous applications to legalise the operation had also been refused by Cornwall Council. This application was essentially the same as previous ones except that a noise assessment had been submitted this time.

The owners' agent spoke in support of PA18/02089. He explained that approval had been granted for a bungalow on the site many years ago and since then a caravan had been on the site with council tax paid on it until the early 2000's. He also reported that this was a brownfield site – a garden - and not a greenfield site.

17/95 Minutes of the meeting of 15th March 2018

Proposed Cllr Wildish, seconded Cllr Shroff and RESOLVED that the minutes be confirmed and signed by the Chairman.

17/96 Matters arising on items not on the agenda- *for report only*

None

17/97 Planning applications

1. PA18/03276. Provide off street parking to front of existing dwelling by constructing a 6m x 5m garage. 39, Polmear Road, Par. It was proposed by Cllr Phillips, seconded Cllr Wildish and RESOLVED that a recommendation of objection should be made to Cornwall Council. *Reasons: 1. Vehicles would have to reverse either into or out of garage. Reversing in would require an awkward manoeuvre on a busy major road. Reversing out, the driver would be unable to see pedestrians on the pavement until they had crossed it. 2. There is no scope for visibility splays and, due to slopes/ bends in the road there is inadequate visibility for safe entry/exit. 3. The construction of a garage as proposed would have a strongly negative impact on the street scene, which is characterised by houses well set back from the road and fronted by spacious gardens. 4. The applicant has parking for 2 vehicles to the rear of the building and chose to demolish the existing garage to extend the house.*

2. PA18/02158. Change of use of land from agricultural to use for storage of building equipment and workshop. E-Van Land South West of Coppergon, Lanescot, Par. It was proposed by Cllr Rowse, seconded Cllr Shroff and RESOLVED that a recommendation of objection should be made to Cornwall Council. *Reason: This is effectively a re-application following a previous refusal. No new evidence has been presented indicating any significant changes of circumstances.*

3. PA18/02445. Works to trees subject to a tree preservation order. Felling of ten Monterey Pines and replacement with suitable specimens. Pine Trees, Kilhallon Par. It was proposed by Cllr Wildish, seconded Cllr Rowse and RESOLVED that a recommendation of objection should be made to Cornwall Council. *Reason: As the house name implies, these trees are an important and longstanding part of the landscape, which should be preserved unless serious, professionally supported, safety arguments are presented. No formal arboricultural statement is attached to the application.*

4. PA18/02089. Construction of a new dwelling. Land adjacent to Wheal Fortune, Porcupine Road, Porcupine, Par. It was proposed by Cllr Phillips, seconded Cllr Shroff and RESOLVED that a recommendation of objection should be made to Cornwall Council. *Reason. The committee recognised that a case can be made for development on this site, given the existence of an earlier planning permission there of similar scale and the lawful location of a large caravan there for many years. However, they were aware that the caravan has not been occupied, in any meaningful sense, for some years and that, since the previous permission was granted, planning laws and policies have changed substantially. The parish council response is based in the context of the current policies and the details in the present submission.*

It was recognised that the proposal represents an innovative design offering a substantial family residence on the site with little more apparent "massing" than the previously approved bungalow. It was also appreciated that care had been taken to preserve the existing trees, which make a significant contribution to the

landscape, both immediate and in a wider context. Some concern was expressed about the nature of the external finishes and it was mentioned that the colour of finishes was important in this location. Although outside the World Heritage boundary by some 200 m to N & W, the proposed property would be prominent in views towards the Grade II Listed Austin's Shaft Engine House (some 400 m NE) from the Par River Valley. In this context, whilst recognising the desire to take advantage of the views out from the site to the Luxulyan Valley, it was disappointing that some (intermittent) soft landscaping had not been introduced on the NW boundary to reduce the visual impact of the development in inward views. In the context of the current Cornwall Local Plan, the committee considered this a "development in the open country". It was not being proposed as an agricultural dwelling, did not offer any "affordable" housing or self-build sites, nor had any other special circumstances been put forward. As such it is not an "exception site".

In terms of sustainability, any occupants would be totally dependent on cars for transport. The nearest facilities are in St Blazey, 16 km away (rather more than the 10 minutes' walk suggested, especially on the return with shopping, with a climb of 50 m). The nearest bus stop is in St Blazey, and Par railway station is about 3.6 km. Children would have to be driven to Tywardreath School (3 km), which has a serious problem with cars dropping off children.

5. PA18/02622. Conversion and extension of the water reservoir to form a single residential dwellinghouse and the installation of a sewage treatment plant. Polharmon Reservoir, Penpillick Hill St Blazey. It was proposed by Cllr Wildish, seconded Cllr Rowse and RESOLVED that a recommendation of objection should be made to Cornwall Council. *Reasons: Residential development at this location would potentially aggravate the difficult and dangerous road safety situation at the junction of the A390 and the Treemill road. Traffic is rightly banned from turning right to access the Treemill road, which is adjacent to the entrance to this property. The parish council strongly objects to this application and considers that it should be made clear at the outset that future developments on this site are unlikely to be successful. The proposal is at odds with the NPPF: "Paragraph 55 presumes in favour of granting planning permission for the residential re-use of redundant or disused buildings located in the countryside, where this conversion would lead to an enhancement of the immediate setting. As demonstrated on the submitted plans, the building is clearly redundant and disused, and its conversion will lead to an enhancement to the setting. The General Structural Appraisal Report confirms that the building is structurally sound and capable of being converted without the need for significant alterations or extensions. In addition to this, there are a number of other dwellings in the immediate area and as such the development would not lead to the provision of any 'isolated' dwelling being provided."*

The existing structure is completely neutral in the landscape. Conversion of the existing structure to residential use would introduce a new element of obviously "built" structure into an essentially pastoral landscape, both in glimpses from the A 390 and more particularly in many wide views over the Treemill Valley and

Tywardreath Historic Battlefield Site from the B3269 and C0067. Whilst not decrying the proposed design, it could not be claimed to be an enhancement. As an effectively “new” building in the open countryside it clearly fails to meet the criteria of sustainable development of Policy 1 of the Cornwall Local Plan, taking account of its location, layout, design and use against the three pillars of economic development, social development and environmental protection and improvement.

The development does not meet the criteria of Policy 2 in that it fails to respect or enhance quality of place whilst offering only a minimal contribution to meeting housing needs, and that in a location which has no demonstrable local need.

Contrary to the applicant’s statement, there is very limited residential use in the near vicinity and it is difficult to see which “influences” have been taken.

The proposal is not for an agricultural worker, nor is it offering any affordable housing or meets any special need; it will not “enhance” the local area. It therefore does not comply with the requirements of Policy 7, nor does it qualify as a Rural Exception site under Policy 9.

In the context of Policy 27, this is not a sustainable site; occupants and visitors will be almost entirely dependent on private transport as (apart from a college bus once per day, schooldays only) the nearest bus service is in St Blazey, (2.6 km) with Par Railway Station 3.8 km. The nearest shops are in St Blazey and the nearest primary school is Tywardreath. Walking is not a realistic possibility as the first 900m of the route into St Blazey is on the A390, an unlit, busy, derestricted road with no footway. Alternative routes are on narrow, unlit twisting country lanes with high hedges and no footway.

Whilst there are clear Policy reasons for refusal, the parish council considers that the strongest argument against granting permission is road safety. County Highways objected to an earlier application as follows:

“: ‘Following assessment, it is my considered opinion that safe and suitable access has not been demonstrated. Whilst supporting information has been considered, the infrequent, and low number of movements associated with the current use of the site, differ to that of the daily movements associated with a dwelling. Given the site is isolated and remote from the nearest settlement the occupants would be substantially reliant upon private vehicle for transport. The proposal will result in an increase in frequent regular daily vehicle movements over the number and frequency currently associated with the site. Reference is made to emerging visibility, and its adequacy, a satisfactory plan has not been provided to demonstrate this. Further, I cannot agree that a clear 215m can be achieved to the south, due to the gradient and alignment of the road, as vehicles are obscured for a time as a consequence. Of greater concern, is the function of the access, specifically vehicles turning right in from the south, and turning right out to the north. This section of road is one of the few on this part of the A390 where overtaking is enabled. As a consequence road speeds are high. I note speed data is provided, however the period over which data was collated does not include either of the peak periods, and is very short. There is no information as to methodology, nor equipment and whether it was satisfactorily calibrated. Further, in the event hand held equipment was used at the point of the access, highway

alignment may have affected the results, and the presence of an individual at the road side with a radar gun in this location would have been prominent, this may also have attributed to a lower speed. Forward visibility of a vehicle waiting to turn right into the site is substandard, particularly for the driver of a vehicle overtaking a larger vehicle travelling north, uphill. Additionally, records held show 6 PI Road Traffic Collisions accidents have occurred on this section of the A390 in the last five years. Interrogation of these records indicates that high speed and overtaking manoeuvres feature. It is my considered opinion that access is neither safe nor suitable and accident data is evidence to support this conclusion. Consequently an objection is raised on grounds of highway safety (submitted by PS).’.”

The parish council considers this to be a fair reflection of the situation both then and now. Whilst one can argue about technicalities, it demonstrates that, in the opinion of a professional assessor, a problem exists.

What is not mentioned in the report is the impact of any development on traffic seeking to enter the A390 from the C0310 Treesmill Road. Although classified as a minor road, it is heavily used as a “rat-run” between the A390 eastbound and Tywardreath and Par. For vehicles entering the A390 here, visibility to the left is seriously obscured by “The Old Forge”. The eastbound section of the A390 here has two lanes and vehicles often approach at high speed to complete overtaking before the two lane section ends. Drivers entering are therefore concentrating on traffic coming up the hill, glancing right only when an opportunity presents itself. It is considered that having vehicles leaving the site less than 100 m to the left will significantly increase the risk of misjudgements for such drivers, with potentially serious consequences.

The parish council considers that, irrespective of the Policy reasons for refusal, traffic safety must be an overwhelming justification for rejecting this, or any other application for development of this site.

6. PA18/02995. Demolish lean-to shed and erect two-storey extension. 4, Kilhallon Par. It was proposed by Cllr Phillips, seconded Cllr Rowse and RESOLVED that a recommendation of no objection should be made to Cornwall Council

17/98 Notice of Appeals

None

17/99 Correspondence

None

Date of Next Meeting 17th May 2018

Meeting Closed 7.10 pm